## Seeds of Knowledge: Premodern Scholarship, Academic Fields, and European Growth

 ${\sf Matthew} \ {\sf Curtis}^1 \quad {\sf David} \ {\sf de} \ {\sf la} \ {\sf Croix}^{2,3}$ 

<sup>1</sup>Syddansk Universitet, <sup>2</sup>IRES/LIDAM, UCLouvain, <sup>3</sup>CEPR, Paris

February 2025





Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
•000	0000000	000		0000000	0000	00

#### Context

- Human capital an engine of modern economic growth
- What about pre-modern human capital?
- RETE: new data on European Academia 1000-1800
- these data cover upper tail human capital involved in universities and academies ( $\equiv$  "academia")
- propositional knowledge, and some knowledge-how
- ightarrow Was pre-modern academia complementary with economic growth?
- $\rightarrow$  Some fields in particular? how to measure fields?

#### Academic institutions

#### **Universities**: emergence during the Middle Ages. Teach Arts (incl. sciences), Theology, Law, Medicine

▶ illustration → map of universities → birth places

**Academies**: informal clubs becoming formal institutions after 1650. Mostly arts & sciences + applied (e.g. mechanics, navigation, cartography) – Meetings, publications, letters, prizes

▶ illustration → map of academies → birth places

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		0000000	0000	00

### Contribution

- New way to measure and classify knowledge in the past
- Scholarship associated with higher regional GDP per capita in 1900
- Academics in general positive, but science and botany particularly
- Find evidence that suggests a role model mechanism

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
000●	0000000	000		0000000	0000	00

### Literature

Growth, knowledge, and human capital

- Big picture (Cervellati and Sunde 2005; Mokyr, 2002; Galor 2022; Strulik 2014)
- Upper tail human capital (Squicciarini and Voigtlaender, 2015; Mokyr, 2016)
- By field: Science (Wootton, 2015), Institutions (Mitterauer, 2010), Theology (Henrich, 2020; Schultz et al, 2019; Weber, 1930), Law (Cantoni et al., 2014), Medicine (Hill, 1915).

Measuring knowledge

- Texts (Almelhem et al. 2023; Grajzl et al, 2023; Koschnick, 2023; Johnson and Taylor, 2023)
- Biographies (Courson et al. 2023; Borowiecki et al., 2024)

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	●000000	000		0000000	0000	00

RETE

Large sample of scholars working in academia in premodern Europe

- European scope (from Evora to Полацк)
- Longue durée (1000-1800)
- Teachers, not students
- 60,001 scholars
- Appointed to universities or nominated to academies
- 535 primary & secondary sources
- Manually linked to WorldCat

Repertorium Eruditorum Totius Europae

## Assigning fields based on sources

For professors we often know in which faculty they belonged (Arts, Law, Medicine, Theology) For academicians, field can be inferred from biographies

Difficulties:

- Optimal number of fields? Which degree of precision ? (ex. should be distinguish Canon law vs Civil law, vs French law)
- In many cases, hard to assign a field: many fellows in Oxford hold a D.D. (Doctor of Divinity) but may have pursued teaching and research in other fields, see "Early Science in Oxford Oxford Colleges and their Men of Sciences" (Gunther 1937)

#### Example of primary source

Register of the Royal Academy of Nimes (France) established by patent letters issued by his Majesty in August 1682

"The 'juge-mage,' from the Latin 'judex major', is an ancient legal function

"Prieur" refers to a person who is the head of a priory, a small monastery.

Liste des Academiciens, dont ceux de la premiere Sondation ont élé rangés par le sort, et les autres en suite selon l'ordre de leur reception. and the second second Francois Annibal de Rochemore, Conseiller du Roy en ses Conseils, President, Juge-mage, & Seutenant general en la Senéchaussee et Siege Presidial de Mismes. Grouping and the sol Joseph de la Baume, Conseiller du Roy en la Senechausee et Siege Presidial de Minner. Jean Saurin Doctour of Arocat Claude on Roverie, seig or Cabrierer. Jean Menard. Prine Prine 24 the

#### Example of secondary source

Series professorum qui in academia rheno-traiectina publice aut docuerunt aut etiamnunc docent (1861)

(The series of professors who have either taught or are currently teaching at the University of Utrecht)

Matheseos: of Mathematics Iuris: law

- 55. Hermannus Alexander Roëll, Marco-Westphalus, nat. a. 1653. Ex academia Franequerana evocatus, Prof. Theologiae d. 22 Sept. 1704. Ob. d. 12 Iulii 1718. \*
- 56. Iosephus Serrurier, Amstelaedamensis, Prof. Philosophiae et Mathemeos d. 3 Febr. 1706, Medicinae et Botanices d. 18 Maii 1716, Institutionum Medicarum d. 7 Iunii 1723. Ob. d. 15 April. 1742. \*
- Iohannes Iacobus Vitriarius, Genevanis, nat. a. 1679. Ex academia Heidelbergensi huc evocatus, Iuris civilis et publici Prof. d. 17 Sept. 1708. In academiam Lugduno-Batavam profectus excunte a. 1719. Oblit d. 11 Dec. 1745. \*
- Hieronymus van Alphen, Hanoviensis, nat.
   d. 12 Maii 1665. In ecclesia Amstelaedamensi Euangelii interpres, huc evocatus, Prof. Theologiae
   d. 26 Febr. 1715. Ob d. 7 Nov. 1742. \*
- Franciscus Burmannus, Franc. F. Zheno-Traiectinus, nat. d. 15 Maii 1671. In ecclesia Amstelaedamensi Euangelii interpres, huc evocatus, Prof. Theologiae d. 26 Febr. 1715. Ob. d. 22 Sept. 1710. \*
- Arnoldus Drakenborch, Rheno-Traiectinus, nat. d. 81 Dec. 1684. Historiarum et Eloquentiae Prof. d. 25 Maii 1716. Ob. d. 16 Ian. 1748. \*

## Example scholar: Pierre Gassendi (1592–1655)

- Doctor in theology, Philosopher, priest, astronomer, and mathematician.
- University of Aix-en-Provence (course on Aristotelian philosophy), Collège Royal in Paris (course on Mathematics), + two informal academies (Investiganti, Mersenne)
- Key figure of Scientific Revolution: he redefined the goal of empirical science as determining probable, rather than certain, results (Applebaum, 2003)
- "The precise place of Gassendi in the history of early modern philosophy and science is only partly articulated by recent scholarship" — Stanford Plato



Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	00000●0	000		0000000	0000	00

#### WorldCat Identities



- Discontinued in March 2023
- Provided data on productivity of scholar and data on "topics"

### WorldCat Identities

**Associated Subjects** 

Aristotle Astrology Annuers Antender grander Astronomy Atomic theory Atomic theory-Historiography Atomism Brahe, Tycho, Contingency (Philosophy) Copernicus, Nicolaus, Descartes, René, Empiricism Epicurus Euc. France Free will and determinism French Iterature Gassendi, Pierre, God--Will-History of doctrines Historians Influence (Literary, artistic, etc.) Locke, John, Logic Meditationes de prima philosophia (Descartes, René) Mind and body Necessity (Philosophy) Optics Peiresc, Nicolaus Claude Fabri de, Persées (Pascel, Blaice) Peurbach, Georg von, Philosophers Philosophy Philosophy, Ancient Presenter Philosophy, French Philosophy, Modern Presenter Philosophy of mind Philosophy of nature Physics-Philosophy Providence and government of God-History of doctrines Regionontanus, Joarnes, Science Science--Philosophy Soc Busener Vite, Trema,

- Cloud of topics: mapping titles of works into FAST (Faceted Application of Subject Terminology) topics
- Relative size, relative importance
- Exact methodology unclear (translations?)
- 17,343 academics have topics
- after dropping topics with fewer than 30 scholars, 16,149 scholars have at least one remaining topic "Mind and Body" concerns 100 scholars

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	●00		0000000	0000	00

#### k-means clustering

Group scholars into academic fields (clusters) using their topics

- 1,360-dimension space, one axis per topic
- Each scholar is a point in the space
- Pick k centroids and assign each scholar to a centroid (centre point of field k)
- Compute the TWSS: total within-cluster sum of squares
- No closed-form solution, use numerical algorithm
- Optimal k: minimize  $BIC = TWSS_k + \log(I)Jk$

IntroductionDataFieldsKnowledge and GrowthEndogeneityMechanismsCon000	Conclusion 00
---	------------------

## Clusters of WorldCat Topics

Cluster Field	N. Scholars	Top 3 Names	Median N. Publ.	Earliest Year	Median Year
Theology 1	1581	Aquinas, Bossuet, Pascal	143	975	1615
Theology 2	940	Luther, Melanchthon, Wesley	315	1039	1671
Politics	990	Swift, Machiavelli, Corneille	184	1043	1756
Law	727	Stryk, Bentham, Bohmer	156	1090	1593
Science	661	Newton, Euler, Galilei	177	1116	1714
Classics	7317	Schiller, Erasmus, Pope	54	970	1712
Philosophy	653	Rousseau, Kant, Diderot	258	980	1700
Botany	543	Linnaeus, Bernardin, Trew	189	1176	1753
Culture	1086	Arouet, Humboldt, Homman	211	1140	1749
Medicine	1651	Haller, Hohenheim, Gessner	125	1025	1698



Introduction         Data         Fields         Knowledge and Growth         Endogeneity         Mechanisms         Co           0000         0000000         000         000         0000000         0000         000         000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         00000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         000000         0000000         000000         0000000         000000         000000         0000000         000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         0000000         000000000         00000000         00000000	troduction	Data 0000000	Fields 00●	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity 0000000	Mechanisms 0000	Conclusion 00
---	------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	------------------------	--------------------	------------------

### Mapping between Clusters of WorldCat Topics and Fields from sources

		Field from source						
Cluster	Theology	Law	Humanities	Medicine	Sciences	Applied Sc.	Social Sc.	unknown
Theology 1	45%	13%	33%	2%	4%	0%	0%	3%
Theology 2	53%	3%	39%	2%	3%	0%	0%	1%
Politics	11%	27%	39%	6%	8%	3%	5%	3%
Law	3%	83%	11%	1%	1%	0%	0%	1%
Science	4%	1%	18%	5%	68%	3%	1%	1%
Classics	16%	14%	40%	11%	13%	3%	1%	3%
Philosophy	16%	5%	59%	4%	13%	0%	1%	1%
Botany	3%	0%	10%	39%	44%	2%	1%	1%
Culture	8%	8%	45%	7%	22%	4%	3%	3%
Medicine	2%	2%	12%	70%	12%	0%	0%	2%

## Application: a growth regression. Measurement

How do we aggregate scholarly output?

- Aggregate by birth/activity/death NUTS2 region
- weighted by f(no. of publications)

Measuring development in 1900: regional GDP per capita from Rosés-Wolf (2023)

- Methodology based on Geary and Stark (2002)
- Combine national GDP and value added by sector with regional wages by sector
- Key assumption is that wages are good proxy for productivity

Controlling for

- Area of NUTS2 region
- Ruggedness from Nunn and Puga (2012)
- Land productivity (post-1500 calorie suitability index, Galor and Özak 2015)

## Regression

	I	og GDP p	er capita, 19	00	2015
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Local scholarship (birth) (1000-1800)	0.187** (0.086)	0.135** (0.060)	0.171*** (0.043)	0.129* (0.067)	0.166*** (0.046)
Share Theology 1			0.215 (0.222)	0.028 (0.173)	0.151 (0.178)
Share Theology 2			1.440*** (0.415)	0.381 (0.501)	0.163 (0.224)
Share Politics			0.417 (0.321)	0.049 (0.131)	-0.065 (0.209)
Share Law			-0.850*** (0.255)	-0.427* (0.208)	-0.081 (0.157)
Share Science			1.451*** (0.470)	1.215*** (0.312)	0.631* (0.323)
Share Philosophy			-0.029 (0.265)	-0.107 (0.126)	0.230* (0.111)
Share Botany			0.856** (0.353)	0.649*** (0.199)	0.677*** (0.143)
Share Culture			0.102 (0.277)	-0.108 (0.358)	-0.162 (0.205)
Share Medicine			0.075 (0.371)	-0.425 (0.525)	-0.055 (0.270)
N Country FEs	172	172 X	172	172 X	165 X



Science and law across place

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		●000000	0000	00

## Endogeneity

Both Human capital and GDP per capita in 1900 may depend on common unobserved variables (a cultural variable perhaps) Or attenuation bias from measurement error? If WorldCat has random errors in the

Or attenuation bias from measurement error? If WorldCat has random errors in the publications

Use episodes of forced migration to suscitate exogenous changes in human capital

- Byzantine scholars and Greeks born between 1389 (the battle of Kosovo) and 1699 (end of Seventh Ottoman–Venetian War)
- French Huguenots born in France between 1572 (the Bartholomew's Day massacre) and 1699 who worked or died in a Protestant region
- British Catholics after the Reformation. All scholars born in Britain between 1558 (the coronation of Queen Elizabeth I) and 1699 who worked or died in a Catholic region

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		000000	0000	00

## Byzantines



Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		00€0000	0000	00

## Huguenots



	Introduction 0000	Data 0000000	Fields 000	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity 000●000	Mechanisms 0000	Conclusion 00
--	----------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	------------------------	--------------------	------------------

## **British Catholics**



	Introduction 0000	Data 0000000	Fields 000	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity 0000●00	Mechanisms 0000	Conclusion 00
--	----------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	------------------------	--------------------	------------------

### IV results

		log GE	DP per capit	a, 1900:		
Panel A: IV	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	
Local scholarship aft. 1700	0.135**	0.274***	0.168***	0.336***	0.315***	
	(0.060)	(0.056)	(0.034)	(0.052)	(0.066)	
Ν	172	172	172	172	172	
	Local scholarship					
Panel B: 1st-stage	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	
N Refugees		0.158***				
		(0.024)				
N Byzantines			0.491***			
			(0.086)			
N Huguenots				0.171***		
				(0.043)		
N British Catholics					0.273***	
					(0.057)	
N		172	172	172	172	
Country FEs		Х	Х	Х	Х	
1st stage F-stat.		95.39	99.29	28.42	38.28	

Result: difference between OLS and IV suggests endogeneity bias barely significant and, if any, of the attenuation type

0000 000000 000 000 000 000 000 000 00	Introduction 0000	Data 0000000	Fields 000	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity 00000●0	Mechanisms 0000	Conclusion 00
--	----------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	------------------------	--------------------	------------------

#### Refugees and future scholarly output: Byzantines, Huguenots and British Catholics







Event study, analyzing the effect of the arrival of a refugee on academic output of the region

 $\rightarrow$  no pre-trend in hosting places and a significant effect on future knowledge

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000	000	000000	0000	00

### Effect of refugees in their specific field

When a refugee arrives, is there a disproportionate increase in scholarship in their particular field in their destination?



Method 🔶 Triple-diff FEs

### The inspiration mechanism

Occupational choice: army vs church vs ... vs academia

Hypothesis: successful scholars inspire fellow natives to choose academia

Finds support through indirect evidence:

- 1. regional development better understood when scholars are aggregated by birthplace rather than their activity location
- 2. scholars who stay closer to their roots demonstrate a stronger correlation with development compared to those who relocate or face an untimely demise
- 3. regions boasting a higher number of scholars born within them exhibited elevated levels of general population numeracy in the late 19th century
- + strong anecdotal evidence

## 1. Birth place vs activity place vs death place

All three ways of aggregating scholars lead to significant results But stronger results obtained with aggregation by birthplace

		le	og GDP pe	er capita, 1	.900	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Local scholarship by						
birthplace	0.187** (0.086)	0.135** (0.060)				
activity place			0.040** (0.017)	0.035** (0.012)		
death place					0.111*** (0.028)	0.096*** (0.019)
N	172	172	172	172	172	172
Adj. <i>R</i> <sup>2</sup>	0.33	0.63	0.30	0.63	0.32	0.64
Country FEs		Х		Х		Х

·····	Introduction 0000	Data 0000000	Fields 000	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity 0000000	Mechanisms 00●0	Conclusion 00
-------	----------------------	-----------------	---------------	----------------------	------------------------	--------------------	------------------

## 2. Groups less likely to inspire

		log G	DP per cap	ita, 1900	
	(1)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Local scholarship (1000-1800)	0.135** (0.059)				
$\times {\rm died}$ in other place			0.085 (0.097)		
$\times {\rm died}$ in same place			0.236*** (0.068)		
imesdied before age 40				-1.959* (0.998)	
imesdied after age 40				0.214** (0.071)	
imesborn before 1600					0.175 (0.150)
imesborn after 1600					0.127 (0.127)
N Country FEs	172	172 X	172 X	172 X	172 X

## Introduction<br/>0000Data<br/>0000Fields<br/>000Knowledge and Growth<br/>000Endogeneity<br/>0000000Mechanisms<br/>0000000Conclusion<br/>000

## Example: Pierre Gassendi

- Born in Champtercier (pop. 856 in 2020)
- Gassendi primary school
- Digne-les-Bains has a Gassendi road, museum, statue, and secondary school
- The moon has a Gassendi crater

• Another example: Fermat

#### 1989 - Ecole maternelle - Ecole pierre gassendi



< >

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		0000000	0000	●○

### Conclusion

- New data on premodern academics grouped into academic fields
- Premodern European scholarship associated economic development
- All scholarship positive, but science and botany more important
- Evidence for an inspiration mechanism

Introduction	Data	Fields	Knowledge and Growth	Endogeneity	Mechanisms	Conclusion
0000	0000000	000		0000000	0000	○●

## Extension

- the 2 million pages of the WorldCat Identities project were suddenly retired in March, 2023.
- the RETE database keeps growing with now 79,000 scholars (January 2025)
- to pursue this line of research we found a viable alternative using statistics drawn from the VIAF platform
- VIAF provides a list of titles, but no word clouds
- in the future: infer the field from the titles. Main challenge: translations
- languages in VIAF: Latin (39%), French (15%), English (12%), German (11%), Italian (7%), Dutch (3%), Spanish (2%)

## Universities



Handwritten lecture notes of George Licton

who studied in Louvain in 1467

▲ Back

## Academies



## Location of Universities (left) and Academies (right)



## Birth places of scholars. Universities (left) and Academies (right)



■ Back

# Fields from sources. Universities (left) and Academies (right)



## Clusters of WorldCat Topics

Clusters	Topic 1	Topic 2	Topic 3	Topic 4	Topic 5
Theology 1	Catholic Church	Theology, Doctrinal	Theology	Clergy	Reformation
Theology 2	Bible	Theology	Theology, Doctrinal	Jesus Christ	Bible.–Old Testament
Politics	Politics and government	Political science	Diplomatic relations	Economics	Catholic Church
Law	Roman law	Law	Canon law	Civil law	Digesta
Science	Mathematics	Astronomy	Geometry	Science	Physics
Classics	Rome (Empire)	Intellectual life	Law	Jesus Christ	Antiquities
Philosophy	Philosophy	Ethics	Logic	Science	Metaphysics
Botany	Botany	Plants	Natural history	Medicine	Botany, Medical
Culture	Travel	Antiquities	Manners and customs	Natural history	Voyages and travels
Medicine	Medicine	Physicians	Human anatomy	Materia medica	Surgery

▲ Back







A Back

## 3. Human capital and general population numeracy in 1900

	Numeracy index c. 1900		
	(1)	(2)	
Local scholarship	3.297*	3.085*	
(1000-1800)	(1.881)	(1.659)	
N	62	102	
Country FEs	×	Х	

*Note:* Numeracy is the ABCC index from Baten and Hippe (2018): 125(1 - s), where s is the share of reported ages ending in 0 or 5. Imputed numeracy assigns a value of 1 to Germany and Scandinavia in 1900.

## Example: Fermat

Born in Beamont-de-Lomagne in 1605 Member of the informal academy of Mersenne in Paris (1636)

- Working life spent in Toulouse at the Parliament
- Beamont-de-Lomagne's pop. in 2020: 3,778
- It has a statue of him, street named after him, a tourism office in his house, and the yearly *fête des maths*

#### **BEAUMONT-DE-LOMAGNE (82)**



#### Inspiration mechanism: general equilibrium model

$$U = \int_0^\infty u(C) \exp(-\rho t) dt$$
  

$$Y = AK^\alpha H^{1-\alpha}$$
  

$$Y = C + I_K + I_H$$
  

$$\dot{K} = I_K - \delta_K K$$
  

$$\dot{H} = I_H - \bar{\delta}_H H$$
  

$$\bar{\delta}_H = \delta_H \left(\frac{s}{H}\right)^{-\eta}$$
  

$$\dot{S} = I_H - \delta_S S$$

Production Resource constraint Capital accumulation Human capital accumulation Depreciation of human capital Inspiration

Utility

Short-run:

$$Y = AK \left(g\left[\frac{S}{H}\right]\right)^{1-\alpha}, \quad g'[\cdot] > 0$$

Along a balanced growth path:

$$\frac{S}{H} = \left(\frac{\delta_H}{\delta_S}\right)^{\frac{1}{1+\eta}}$$